# Managing relationships in the Tourism Supply Chain to overcome epidemic

# outbreaks: the case of COVID-19 and the hospitality industry in Spain

- 3 Abstract: The rapid spatial diffusion of the COVID-19 epidemic outbreak has resulted
- 4 in the total economic disruption of the Tourism Supply Chain (TSC) causing a significant
- 5 reduction in revenue and creating liquidity issues for all operators. Firms in TSC are
- 6 linked to each other in complex patterns, leading one risk to another. The purpose of this
- 7 article is to understand the role of relationship management between hotel chains and
- 8 their key TSC agents in order to overcome economic disruptions caused by epidemic
- 9 outbreaks. Among the main contributions is the identification of governments, tour
- operators, and competitors as the key relationships to be managed by hospitality firms. In
- addition, key areas for coordination with these actors are explored. Finally, the objectives
- of relationship management according to the partner are also addressed.
- 13 **Keywords:** COVID-19; economic disruption; hospitality industry; hotel chains;
- 14 Tourism Supply Chain (TSC)
- 15 **Declarations of interest:** none

#### 16 1. Introduction

- 17 The cross-cutting, interdependent, and fragmented nature of tourism products forces firms
- 18 to establish relationships with numerous stakeholders in the industry -suppliers,
- distributors, competitors, governments and other firms—, resulting in Tourism Supply
- 20 Chains (TSC). Cooperation is therefore seen as a driver of agility, flexibility and
- 21 organizational performance. However, being a coordination-intensive industry represents
- a risk due to the high dependency on the supply chain. Any shock from one agent quickly
- spreads to others, producing cascading effects on the TSC (Sigala, 2004; Zhang, Song &
- Huang, 2009; OECD, 2020). Consequently, it could be said tourism is a very sensitive
- and vulnerable sector to any risk situation caused by external factors, whether it is a
- 26 natural disaster, an economic crisis, an international conflict, terrorism or an epidemic
- outbreak (Pizam & Fleischer, 2002; Kuo, Chen, Tseng, Ju & Huang, 2008; Jiang, Ritchie
- 28 & Benckendorff, 2019).
- 29 The rapid spatial diffusion of the COVID-19 epidemic outbreak led the World Health
- 30 Organization (WHO) to announce the pandemic (March, 11, 2020), resulting in border
- 31 closures and mandatory mass quarantine, with the consequent total economic disruption

- of the activities of TSCs. The impacts of this pandemic on the travel and tourism sector
- 33 is unprecedented and fast-changing. Airlines have had to drastically reduce their
- 34 activities, and in some cases even suspend them. It is estimated that the fall in
- international passenger traffic during 2020 will be equivalent to a reduction of between
- 36 44 and 80% (ICAO, 2020). Tour operators have also decreased or stopped their operations
- from mid-March to at least mid-May 2020 (OECD, 2020).
- For the hospitality industry this has meant extremely low occupancy rates and even mass
- 39 closures. In Europe it was estimated that 76% of hotels were closed (OECD, 2020). In
- 40 Spain, one of the countries most dependent on tourism, as a result of the restrictions in
- 41 the first three weeks of June 2020, only 35.4% of hotels were open and 17.6% of bed-
- 42 places were offered, compared to 2019. In the same line, overnight stays in hotel
- establishments fell by 95.1% in June (INE, 2020).
- In this context, revenue is expected to drop 50% for hotels, 70% for tour operators and
- 45 90% for airlines (European Parliament, 2020). All this has putted the tourism industry
- 46 under unprecedented pressure, causing a significant reduction in revenue and creating
- 47 liquidity issues for all operators (De Rosa, Lanzilotta, Perazzo & Vigorito, 2020).
- 48 General literature on supply chains has addressed two types of risks to be faced by supply
- 49 chains. On the one hand, operational risks can cause disturbances like demand
- 50 fluctuations, as happened with the S.A.R.S. epidemic (Kinra, Ivanov, Das & Dolgui,
- 51 2019; Ivanov, 2020). The work of Fung & Fung (2014) identify interruptions on the TSC
- 52 causing safety issues or inconvenient to tourists making them dissatisfied –shortage of
- 53 quality food supply; electricity outage; computer systems outage; natural disasters etc. –
- 54 . The authors propose managing the issue, the risk and the reputation in order to provide
- 55 the tourist service under that circumstances. On the other hand, disruption risks in supply
- 56 chains are low-frequency-high-impact events characterized by a long term business
- 57 interruption with an unpredictable scaling, as the COVID-19 pandemic. Disruption risks
- in supply chains are also characterized by the simultaneous disruption propagation in the
- supply chain and demand (ripple effect) (Kinra et al., 2019; Ivanov, 2020).
- TSC research has gained recent attention among scholars, (e.g., Mandal & Saravanan,
- 61 2019; Richards & Font, 2019). Although not directly related to crisis management, Zhang
- et al. (2009) identify a diversity of areas to address in order to obtain all the benefits from

- 63 the TSC. Considering the nature and characteristics of TSCs, they propose coordination
- between two-party relationships as key management aspects, among others.
- 65 Besides this work, little is known about how to manage relationships with key
- stakeholders within the TSC in order to overcome disruption risks caused by epidemic
- outbreaks. However, according to recent research on crisis management in the tourism
- 68 industry, the existing interconnectivity and relationships can be a key aspect in the
- 69 recovery of the industry by mitigating the negative effects of the economic impact of
- 70 COVID-19 (Racherla & Hu, 2009; Orchiston & Higham, 2016; Jiang & Ritchie, 2017).
- 71 In light of this unprecedented situation that affects all members of the TSC in different
- ways, the purpose of this article is to understand the role of relationship management
- between hotel chains and their key TSC agents in order to overcome economic disruptions
- caused by epidemic outbreaks. More specifically, this article focuses on understanding
- 75 coordination as a decision-making strategy of TSC participants through diverse
- 76 arrangements.
- 77 According to Manuj & Mentzer (2008), taking into account the novelty of the
- 78 phenomenon, a qualitative research design was chosen. Given the descriptive nature of
- 79 the phenomenon, the extent of the literature, and the first-hand information available, the
- 80 case study approach has been used in this article. Based on the analysis of in-depth
- qualitative interviews with the CEOs and senior managers of three international hotel
- 82 chains, three major contributions are made.
- 83 First, the results reveal that in circumstances of economic disruptions caused by
- pandemics and other disasters, the business objectives of hotel chains move from cost
- 85 reduction and operational efficiency to obtaining —or not losing—liquidity, preserving
- 86 labor relationships, reactivating international arrivals, attracting customers, reducing
- 87 dependence on tour operators and achieving fair relations and greater control over the end
- 88 customer and, finally, ensuring a favorable regulatory framework for the industry.
- 89 Another contribution of the study is the identification of the crucial two-party
- 90 relationships to be managed by hospitality firms in order to achieve the previous goals —
- 91 governments, tour operators, and competitors—. Finally, it is demonstrated the need of
- 92 coordination between hotel chains and their key TSC agents in the areas of finance, labor,
- 93 demand, supply and regulation—.

# 2. Literature review: Two-party relationship management within the Tourism

# Supply Chain (TSC) and economic disruptions

- The economic disruption resulting from the COVID-19 epidemic outbreak is causing
- 97 uncertainty in tourism markets. This is not new, since uncertainty about future demand is
- a significant feature of the tourism sector (Williams & Baláž, 2015). However, the border
- 99 closures and mandatory mass quarantine have led to an exceptional situation never
- 100 experienced before.

- 101 Companies have to cope with costs related to closing down premises, maintaining the
- disinfection of working environments, employees' leaves to prevent any possible spread
- of the virus or the cancellation of reservations, among others. In addition, some
- 104 companies have provided infrastructure and even funds to assist the government in
- addressing the pandemic (Ataguba, 2020).
- Tourism products are viewed as value added chains of different service components
- resulting from complex interactions among numerous stakeholders (Guo & He, 2012).
- Zhang, Song & Huang (2009: 347) refer to this network as a Tourism Supply Chain
- 109 (TSC): "a network of tourism organizations engaged in different activities ranging from
- the supply of different components of tourism products/services such as flights and
- accommodation to the distribution and marketing of the final tourism product at a specific
- tourism destination, and involves a wide range of participants in both the private and
- public sectors".
- 114 Considering the objectives of the different organizations, effective upstream and
- downstream relationship management and coordination within the supply chain is a key
- issue in achieving and maintaining competitiveness for the entire supply chain and its
- individual agents (Monczka, Petersen, Handifield & Ragatz, 1998; Chen, Federgruen, &
- 2001; Tapper & Font, 2004; Christopher, 2011). This implies two-party
- relationships among heterogeneous and homogeneous tourism agents. Heterogeneous
- players whose capabilities do not overlap represent vertical relationships –hotels and tour
- operators—. Horizontal cooperation—also called coopetition—implies the establishment of
- 122 collaboration relations among firms at the same level of production, such as hotels
- cooperating with one another (Chathoth and Olsen, 2003).
- Relationships within the supply chain can take multiple forms: arm's length, strategic
- alliance, vertical integration, cooperation, and competition, among others. Early research

has emphasized arm's-length as the traditional way of relating. With this method, both 126 127 parties act in their own self interest and make their own decisions without any 128 consideration of the impacts of the decisions on the other party (Hoyt & Huq, 2000; Zhang 129 et al., 2009). However, efficiently managing the operations of the TSC and achieving individual business goals requires a move away from arms-length relationships towards 130 131 coordination and cooperation between organizations through a TSC (Zhang et al., 2009). 132 Relationships based on coordination and a win-win philosophy can improve firm performance (Handfield and Nichols, 1999). In addition, when the environment is 133 134 uncertain, agreements based on trust are positively related with firm performance, give that these arrangements are more flexible and can be modified easily (Goldhar & Lei, 135 136 1991; Hoyt & Huq, 2000). Coordination requires that each agent in a supply chain operates considering the impact 137 of its actions on the other players. Full vertical integration is recognized as the most 138 effective way to achieve coordination. However, this strategy is often related to increasing 139 fixed costs and reducing flexibility to cope with market changes. Moreover, TSC actors 140 are often independent firms having conflicting objectives (Gomez and Sinclair, 1991; 141 142 Lafferty & van Fossen, 2001). This article focuses on understanding coordination as a 143 decision-making strategy of TSC participants through diverse arrangements. Supply 144 chain coordination strategies are already adopted by many large tourism firms especially 145 between service providers such as hotels and airlines, and tour operators and travel agencies (Buhalis & Laws, 2001; Guo & He, 2012). 146 147 Among the main business benefits are improved brand value, reputation, image and status. In the current circumstances, emphasis must be given to benefits like reduced costs 148 and operational efficiency, which makes firms more competitive to assess and respond to 149 risks and opportunities in the market, as well as staying ahead of legislative requirements 150 (Tapper & Font, 2004). 151 152 A typical tourism value chain is comprised by suppliers, tour operators, competitors, partners, governments, and other firms carrying out complementary activities (Kaukal, 153 154 Werthner & Hoepken, 2000; Zhang et al., 2009). According to our in-depth interviews, the crucial two- party relationships to be managed by hospitality firms in contexts of 155 156 economic disruptions are: the government, tour operators, and competitors. In addition, following the work of Zhang et al. (2009), besides coordination between two-party 157

- relationships, we propose key issues to be managed in a TSC in order to overcome
- disruption risks caused by disasters: finance, labor demand, supply and regulation.

# 2.1. Government relationship management

- Recent research recognizes that public support from governments is crucial to the growth
- of the tourism industry due to intervention in political and economic affairs (Nunkoo &
- Ramkissoon, 2011; Rivera-Mateos & Félix-Mendoza, 2019). During the early post-
- pandemic periods, it is essential to provide the liquidity necessary for the system to
- recover and to avoid the disappearance of companies and economic collapse (Onrubia-
- 166 Fernández, 2020).

- Since mid-March 2020, most European governments have mobilized their development
- banks to ease the financing and liquidity constraints experienced by companies. The
- Spanish government, through its national development bank (Instituto de Crédito Oficial,
- 170 ICO), adopted a package of economic measures, the most important of which is the 100
- billion € loan guarantee scheme to support companies affected by the COVID-19 crisis
- 172 (Mertens, Rubio & Thiemann, 2020).
- Public development banks should play a countercyclical role helping firms to mitigate the
- impact of economic shocks. Their goal is to provide funds on preferential terms to meet
- 175 costs related to the production cycle, especially working capital: payroll, supplier
- payments, purchases of goods etc. (Del Campo & Ferreiro, 2012; Mertens et al., 2020).
- 177 In compliance with the objectives of the public development banks, commercial banks
- are supposed to transfer the benefits of the public guarantee to their customers, in the
- 179 form of preferential conditions in terms of interest, commissions, guarantees etc. (Del
- 180 Campo & Ferreiro, 2012; Mertens et al., 2020).
- Providing liquidity effectively and efficiently requires a combination of financial and tax
- policies. When depressed demand due to unemployment, uncertainty and depleted
- savings is restricting economic activity, it is crucial to delay or forgive taxes that can be
- easily adjusted (Kopczuk, 2020; Serrano-Antón, 2020). However, there are no tax
- policies to support the Spanish hotel industry in this crisis (Ranera, 2020).
- Tourism is a labor intensive industry, consequently, labor agreements with governments
- are crucial to survive in the current context. During the COVID-19 outbreak, the Spanish
- 188 government has allowed many businesses to temporarily lay off their employees

- 189 (Onrubia-Fernández, 2020). A temporary layoff is a "temporary suspension of the
- employment relationship which unites employees and employers. The employee ceases
- to provide labor to the employer, and the employer ceases to pay the employee" (Lord &
- Saad, 2020: 15). Due to force majeure during the alarm state, the subsidy has covered up
- to 70% of payroll costs, up to a maximum of 1.098 € per employee. In addition,
- 194 companies with more than 50 employees can obtain a 75% reduction in their social
- security contribution and 100% if the workforce does not exceed this threshold (Real
- 196 Decreto-Ley 8/2020; López-Ahumada, 2020).
- 197 The activities of TSC members are directly driven by tourism demand (Zhang et al.,
- 198 2009). Economic conditions are traditional determinants of international tourism demand
- 199 (Kim & Lee, 2017). However, epidemic outbreaks can cause tourists to avoid an area
- since these events are linked to health risk and malfunction of the medical system (Lee,
- 201 Song, Bendle, Kim & Han, 2012). Thus, the decrease in tourism associated with the
- 202 COVID-19 crisis will be related not only to the customer economic conditions, but also
- to health issues.
- Demand management includes forecasting, marketing, and sales planning (Zhang et al.,
- 205 2009). Studies highlighting the role of governments stimulating international tourism
- demand are mainly focused on marketing activities such as destination promotion (e.g.
- Tosun, 2002; Law, Goh & Pine, 2004) and government-supported tourism (e.g. Kim, Lee
- 208 & Mjelde, 2018).
- 209 Kim et al. (2018) highlight the usefulness of establishing ties between countries to
- 210 stimulate tourism flows after a crisis —government-supported tourism—. Considering
- 211 the current health context and the opening of EU borders, a possible avenue for the
- recovery of international tourism is through collaboration with governments.
- 213 Countries like Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania or the Nordic region, are looking to permit
- travel with neighboring countries through what is called 'travel bubbles' or 'airbridges'
- between countries where the virus is contained. (OECD, 2020). The East–West Economic
- 216 Corridor (EWEC) between the Andaman Sea and South China Sea is another example of
- an economic corridor, including cooperative tourism policies between countries such as
- simplification of entry and exit procedures, road improvements and destination promotion
- campaigns (Lebel & Lebel, 2019). This type of economic corridors are global and
- 220 regional value chains providing connection between economic agents along a defined

- 221 geography. They link the supply and demand sides of markets, stimulate economic
- growth, alleviate poverty and benefit from globalization. Accordingly, they prosper as
- part of an economic network of interactions (Brunner, 2013; Lebel & Lebel, 2019).

### 2.2. Tour operator relationship management

- Supply management represents the buyer-supplier relationship in the supply chain
- 226 (Leenders, Fearson, Flynn & Johnson, 2002). Many hotel chains depend almost entirely
- on tour operators for the distribution of their services and visibility in their main markets
- 228 (Karamustafa, 2000; Bastakis, Buhalis & Butler, 2004; Calveras & Orfila-Sintes, 2019).
- 229 Conflicts between tour operators and hotels often arise because of different commercial
- and strategic interests. Hotel companies seek to maximize their revenues and achieve a
- reasonable return on investment by balancing customer volume with average room rates,
- 232 Thanks to 'guaranteed' accommodation contracts with tour operators, hotel operators
- 233 guarantee payment regardless of occupation. On the other hand, the competitiveness of
- tour operators is based on reducing prices and profit margins paid to hotel companies
- 235 (Buhalis, 2000; Medina-Muñoz & García-Falcón, 2000; Medina-Muñoz, Medina-Muñoz
- 236 & García-Falcón, 2003; Tapper & Font, 2004).
- In addition, tour operators are often vertically integrated, controlling carriers (charter
- 238 airlines) and retailers (travel agency chains). This, combined with slower growth in
- demand for mature destinations and low asset specificity, allows them to increase their
- 240 bargaining power and interorganizational control over the hospitality firm suppliers
- 241 (Buhalis, 2000; Bastakis et al., 2004). Consequently, tour operators are able to exert
- influence on the hospitality companies to achieve their own individual goals and interests.
- 243 The most controlled aspects by tour operators are those related to contracts, especially
- 244 economic and financial issues such as payments, guarantees and release conditions to
- 245 which the tour operator is subject: guarantees and compensation offered to the tour
- operator; prices, discounts and special promotions offered to the tour operator (Medina-
- 247 Muñoz et al., 2003).
- 248 Research on the relationship between tour operators and hotels shows that having good
- 249 relationships with the tour operator is crucial to success. Medina-Muñoz and García-
- Falcón (2000) reveal that trust, commitment, coordination, quality of communication,
- exchange of information, participation, use of constructive resolution techniques and

similar relative dependence are the key factors in the relationship between hotels and tour operators.

In general, interorganizational relationships are successful when the conditions and the environment are favorable (Mohr & Spekman, 1994). However, changes in the market are a potential source of fail in supply chain partnerships (Forrest & Martin, 1990). According to the study by Tse (2003), after the impact of events such as terrorist attacks and epidemic outbreaks, many hospitality companies have built their own websites to sell their accommodation services directly. This strategy will reduce the dependence on tour operators and therefore the possible uncertainty if they do not fulfil their obligations. In these cases, the possible reactions of tour operators must be estimated, and possible losses must be justified or compensated for by communicating the message honestly to them as soon as possible. In contrast, the recent study by Calveras and Orfila-Sintes (2019) confirms that, despite the impact of information technology on the organization of the hotel value chain, there has been no significant decrease in the presence of intermediaries in hotel distribution.

#### 2.3. Competitors relationship management

- The establishment of alliances is increasingly considered a critical aspect in achieving
- 269 competitive advantage for hospitality firms (Pechlaner and Volgger, 2012). Horizontal
- 270 collaboration between competitors —also called *coopetition* (Gnyawali and Madhavan,
- 271 2001). exist among homogeneous agents in the same level of the supply chain
- 272 (Pomponi, Fratocchi & Tafuri, 2015).
- Value and mutual benefits between different hospitality companies are created when the
- 274 joint exploitation of resources neutralize individual firm's weaknesses. Efficient
- 275 coopetition should be limited to those areas where there is no rivalry, where there are
- common interests, (Wang and Krakover, 2008), or to influence an industry- favorable
- 277 regulatory framework (Tether, 2002).
- 278 In order to do so, competitors should consider the impact of their actions on the other
- agents (Szpilko, 2017). Thus, a win-win premise based on trust among agents can lead to
- a stronger sustainable competitive advantage. Trust implies that actors do not act
- opportunistically even if there are short-term incentives to do so (Chiles and McMackin,
- 282 1996; Yu, 2019).

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

As mentioned above, the existence of tourist demand is a common interest for all members of the TSC within a destination. According to OECD (2020), a key issue for the recovery of destinations during this type of crisis is to keep the critical mass of services in place to serve visitors when they arrive. *Coopetition* in tourist destinations is a powerful determinant to gain competitive advantage for both the destination and the individual firms (von Friedrichs Grängsjö & Gummesson, 2006; Martínez-Pérez, García-Villaverde & Elche, 2016). Generally, large hospitality companies collaborate with competitors to address environmental threats related to the maturity phase of the industry. With an established market, the main focus is therefore on destination marketing and development activities to improve the competitive position by increasing trial and repurchase, hence improving the market base of both firms (Chathoth & Olsen, 2003; von Friedrichs Grängsjö & Gummesson, 2006).

From a sectoral perspective, *coopetition* is particularly useful in increasing bargaining power at the industry level and therefore in addressing issues such as the creation of sector-specific regulation (Tether, 2002; Chathoth and Olsen, 2003). In order to do so, the relative relevance of individual sectors within an industry is crucial (Hall, 1994;

299 Zhang, Song & Huang, 2009).

#### 3. Materials and methods

# 3.1. Sampling procedure and data collection

In order to achieve the main purpose of this study, hotel chains in Spain were selected. Three key factors suggested the sample. First, because of their relevance in the Spanish tourism industry. In Spain there are almost 15,000 hotels and more than 200 hotel chains —managing 3,800 hotels— (Ortega-Pestana, 2019). Second, because Spain is a country that has suffered drastically from the health and economic consequences of the COVID-19 epidemic outbreak (ECDC, 2020). Finally, because of the proactive attitude both to mitigate the effects of the pandemic and to plan the return to activity in a competitive manner.

The sample for this study consists of three international hotel chains located among the 60 hotel chains with more presence in Spain. The first hotel chain (A) currently has 72 establishments and more than 3,000 rooms in more than 20 different destinations —55 in Spain—. The second one (B) has 35 hotels —30 in Spain— with more than 1,300 rooms.

The third hotel chain (C) has 36 establishments in Spain and more than 1,000 rooms (see Table 1). All these companies have hotels dedicated to both vacation for leisure tourists, and urban offerings for business travelers. Accordingly, the establishments are mainly located in urban and beach destinations.

Table 1. Stages of the case study approach.

318

#### **Profile**

Review of Literature (Web of Science and Scopus)

# Sample selection

Hotel Chain A (72 hotels) Hotel Chain B (35 hotels)

Hotel Chain C (36 hotels)

(Spain strategic business units from three international hotel groups)

## Units of analysis

Hotel Chain A CEO

Hotel Chain B CEO

Hotel Chain C CEO

Total CEOs: 3 respondents

Hotel Chain A area managers (operations, financial and human resources)

Hotel Chain B area managers (operations, financial and human resources)

Hotel Chain C area managers (operations, financial and human resources)

Total senior managers: 9 respondents

#### **Information gathering**

9 semi-structured interviews: 2020 senior managers (operations, financial and human resourcess)

3 open interviews: 2020 (CEO)

Internal and external documents: 2020

(Principle of triangulation)

# **Information transcription**

ATLAS.ti (qualitative data analysis)

Data records and classification:

(1) internal documents, (2) external documents,

(3) interviews, and (4) field notes

# Results and conclusions

Conformity with the analysis results

Conclusions, along with literature and professional implications

- Source: adapted from Rodríguez-Sánchez, Ortiz-de-Urbina-Criado & Mora-Valentín, (2019).
- 321 Considering the descriptive nature of the phenomenon, the extent of the literature and the
- first-hand information available, the case study approach has been used in this article.
- According to Merriam (1998), the case study approach, within the qualitative research,
- enables a deeper understanding of a specific social phenomenon. In contrast to the

quantitative theory-testing empirical approach, the methodology of inductive qualitative research to analyze the content of interview documents is widely accepted in order to construct better theories for practice (Pieterse, 2020). Following Ahmad & Ali (2003: 2), the in-depth interview method is particularly useful when "there is a concern for understanding how things happen and how they are related, rather than only measuring the relation-ship between variables". Moreover, it is also relevant when the goal is to understand, resolve, or improve a procedure carried out in the professional world (Larrinaga & Rodríguez, 2010).

The respondents were chosen for their expertise, that is, as key informants, to explore their views on their relationships with their key TSC agents in order to overcome the economic disruptions caused by the COVID-19 epidemic outbreak. Following the purposive sampling method (Sangpikul and Kim, 2009), only top-level hotel executives and managers were sampled, given their high position in the information hierarchy, as they are all responsible for high-level corporate decision-making (Kruesi, Kim and Hemmington, 2017).

In order to have access to such high-level executives, the research team considered it appropriate to make contact through Linkedin, since it is the largest professional network in the world on the Internet. A total of 30 potential interviewees were identified and contacted. However, the number of interviews and informants was not specified at the beginning of the research, and it was decided that a strategy of "theoretical saturation" would be followed to determine this. In order to promote an open dialogue, evidence was collected through open and semi-structured interviews that began with broad open-ended questions, followed by focused and directed questions as the interviews progressed within and between interviews (Morrison, Haley, Sheehan & Taylor, 2002; Manuj & Mentzer, 2008). Interviews continued until "theoretical saturation" was reached, in other words, until it was perceived that informants did not reveal any new information and reported similar and consistent information to support the validity and quality of the theoretical model (Yin, 1998). According to Strauss and Corbin (1998), twelve interviews meet the qualitative research guidelines that eight or fewer informants usually provide theoretical saturation.

The respondents were all in high-level management positions and had extensive experience in the hotel industry, they were all male and their ages ranged between 40 and

60 years of age. The interviews were conducted with three (operations, financial and human resources) area managers from the three hotels groups. On the other hand, we also conducted three in-depth open interviews with CEOs from the different firms. The diversity in the backgrounds of the informants, both in terms of their position in the organizational structure and the department, has led to different perspectives, enriching the analysis and the implications of the research. The interviews, which lasted on average between one and one and a half hours, were conducted by webinar using the Microsoft Teams tool.

As a complement to the interviews, we participated in webinars, interviews or events organized by the different hotel groups. Finally, to complete the principle of triangulation in the collection of information, we accessed internal documents. Consequently, we triangulated the study to ensure internal validity and minimize possible bias in drawing conclusions (Breitmayer, Ayres & Knafl, 1993).

#### 3.2. Data analysis

All interviews were conducted in Spanish and were recorded and fully transcribed. Once the research team became familiar with the text and its interpretations, all interviews were translated into English. The qualitative data collected were analyzed through a content analysis assisted by the software programme ATLAS.ti. This software enables the systematization of the findings according to categories and subcategories illustrated through conceptual networks (Friese, 2018).

According to Varguillas (2006), the process involves four stages: information (data) coding; categorization; structuring or creating one or more networks of relationships or flowcharts, mind maps or concept maps between categories; and structuring findings or theorizing if applicable. Consequently, we generated an initial set of categories based on the theoretical framework and the interview guidelines. Then, the transcribed interviews were entered in the software to arrange data into value codes. To do this, we group the quotes that are repeated in a patterned manner, to generate codes. The next step involved grouping the interrelated codes under the pre-established categories before determining the definitive categories and codes. Finally, in order to contrast the independent interpretations of the research team and to confirm relationships among codes and categories, we conducted diverse team meetings.

After this process, three main categories themes emerged regarding the management of relationships: governments, tour operators and competitors. These codes or categories were at the same time linked with the codes related with the diverse coordination areas: finance, labor, demand, supply and regulation.

#### 4. Results

The two-party relationships within the hospitality firm and its key TSC members were all discussed with the respondents. Management and coordination aspects in order to overcome disruption risks caused by epidemic outbreaks were also explored.

#### 4.1. Governments relationship management: coordination areas

Initially, the importance of public support from governments was probed. All respondents stressed that government intervention is crucial for the industry. The following quote shows how a Hotel Chain A operations area manager value the role of governments:

"Faced with this crisis, government action is the most important thing for our industry. The regulatory framework that will help businesses to prosper will depend on the success of their decisions."

The feedback from respondents has provided insight into the main areas of relations with governments to overcome economic disruptions. On the one hand areas such as finance, taxation and labor —aimed at providing liquidity—, and on the other hand, demand-stimulating issues —aimed at reactivating international arrivals—.

Hotel Chain B financial area manager highlights the critical role of liquidity in surviving uncertain environments for the hospitality industry:

"The industry is facing high levels of uncertainty. We do not know if there will be new epidemic outbreaks, when a vaccine will be available, or how this will affect tourism demand. We still have to deal with a lot of costs related to rent, taxes, maintenance of the facilities, employees, losses related to the hotel opening with less occupation etc. In order to be able to cope with this situation and guarantee survival, liquidity is essential"

#### 4.1.1. Coordination in the financial and fiscal areas

Since mid-March 2020, most European governments have mobilized their development 416 417 banks to ease the financing and liquidity constraints experienced by companies. A Hotel Chain C CEO discusses the scope of the funds in Spain: 418 419 "ICO credit lines are especially useful for companies with low financial solvency 420 that may have difficulties in obtaining a commercial bank loan. Compared to other European countries, the Spanish funds are not sufficient given that it cover 421 up to 70% of new loans and 60% of renewal operations." 422 The quote below –where the Hotel Chain A CEO compares European and Spanish interest 423 424 rates-illustrates the conflicting interests between the ICO and the commercial banks, and the consequences for companies: 425 "Compared to the European Central Bank—interest rates at 0% during the 426 427 critical situation—, in Spain, the interest rates on ICO loans could have been more advantageous. It is obvious that the banks have to do their business, but it was not 428 429 about that, it was about helping." Hotel Chain B financial area manager also discusses how the bank's objectives often 430 431 override the ICO's primary function of providing liquidity: "The ICO credit lines are limited and insufficient, so the banks firstly cover their 432 own needs, prioritizing the protection of their debts. Thus, they are granting ICO 433 loans with government guarantees to companies that have loans with themselves, 434 435 to cover their own repayments. Therefore, the system is not being injected effectively." 436 Furthermore the observation of the following senior manager is in line with research by 437 Kopczuk (2020), who points out the relevance of preventing the damage from lost cash 438 flow for larger businesses in particular industries. However, the real problem is for 439 440 businesses that do not have the same access to credit market and that cannot realistically raise outside equity. Accordingly, the Hotel Chain B CEO affirms: 441 "Companies that are less solvent do not have access to commercial bank loans will 442 443 have great difficulty obtaining liquidity in times of economic disruption. It would be desirable for governments to establish genuinely favorable conditions and rules for 444 access to ICO loans that cannot be changed by commercial banks." 445

Providing liquidity effectively and efficiently requires a combination of financial and tax 446 policies (Kopczuk, 2020; Serrano-Antón, 2020). The quotes below confirms that there 447 448 are no tax policies to support the Spanish hotel industry in this crisis as well as illustrates 449 the most appropriate fiscal measures according to the Hotel Chain A CEO and operations area manager —corporate tax rate, property tax and VAT—: 450 "Approval of tax deferral for an industry particularly affected by the crisis, such 451 452 as hospitality, would be key to maintaining liquidity and avoiding future 453 bankruptcies. After some years of economic prosperity, the most useful measure would be the reduction or deferral of the corporate tax rate, in order to offset 454 current losses and maintain liquidity." 455 Hotel Chain B financial area manager remarks: 456 457 "For hospitality companies with a large number of establishments in ownership, it will be very useful the property tax deduction equivalent to a percentage of the 458 amount paid for renting buildings where economic activity takes place during the 459 pandemic." 460 461 Finally, Hotel Chain C CEO concludes: "Another much more direct element would be to temporarily reduce VAT on hotel 462 463 stays. This would allow us to be much more competitive in reducing the rate without this going directly against the hotel's margin." 464 4.1.2. Coordination in the labor area 465 By adopting temporary layoffs, governments provide business with payroll flexibility, 466 helping to preserve the liquidity of the company (Kopczuk, 2020; Lord & Saad, 2020). 467 Hotel Chain C human resources area manager highlights the critical role of this measure: 468 "In labor-intensive industries like hospitality, flexibility on a major cost such as 469 470 payrolls can ensure the survival. Temporary layoff—due to force majeure— has 471 been the only useful and appropriate measure to preserve liquidity, otherwise our firm would have gone bankrupt in 6 weeks." 472 473 Consistent with the work of López-Ahumada (2020), a Hotel Chain A CEO confirms that by adopting this measure, governments help preserve the employment relationship: 474

"For hospitality companies, employees are the most important resource. The company has allocated resources to recruit and train. Therefore, we cannot afford to lose this talent or the investment."

Hotel Chain B CEO suggested that, considering that this measure is not newly created, it should be addressed in a comprehensive and long term manner:

"This measure is useless unless it is aligned with the demand recovery. Great part of the hospitality industry largely depends on international tourism demand, which we expect to recover gradually."

The feedback from respondents has provided insights into whether this measure can be improved for the hospitality industry. Hotel Chain C operations area manager speculates on the possibility of keeping employees on payroll:

"We always complain about the lack of professionalism in the tourism industry. Governments could subsidize companies that keep employees on payroll or at least provide them with the temporary liquidity to do so. Even if hotels are closed, the employees could be receiving online training in the new health protocols or in new strategies and operations for the new context."

#### 4.1.3 Coordination in the demand area

Tourism Supply Chain activities are directly driven by tourism demand. Spain received in 2018 the visit of 82.8 million international tourists. The United Kingdom was the main issuing country, accounting for 22.4% of the total. Germany and France were the following most important countries of residence of tourists visiting Spain in 2018, accounting for 13.8% and 13.7% respectively (INE, 2019). The quote below illustrates the relevance of international versus domestic tourism in order to overcome this crisis. This action was highlighted by the Hotel Chain B CEO:

"The hospitality industry in Spain cannot be kept alive through domestic demand given the lower travel rate and purchasing power as well as high levels of seasonality—from 15 July to 15 August—. The Spanish hospitality industry is dimensioned for a global and international demand, mostly localized in coast and beach destinations—90% of the activity—. Accordingly, international demand reactivation is crucial to survive in this crisis."

505	The interviews revealed diverse points of view regarding the responsibility and capacity
506	of the government in stimulating international demand after the economic interruption.
507	Hotel Chain A human resources area manager said:
508	"It is necessary to generate trust so that people will want to travel and stay in our
509	hotels. However, if demand is not reactivated through institutional mechanisms
510	—health measures at airports, ease of travel, availability of tourism resources,
511	etc. —there is no point in what individual firms can do."
512	On the other hand, regarding the capacity of the state to promote international demand,
513	Hotel Chain B CEO remarked:
514	"I do not believe in the capacity of the state to generate or stimulate any kind of
515	demand. The budget available to the institution in charge of promoting Spain is
516	very limited. In view of the expected economic disruption and consequent
517	uncertainty for potential tourists, effective demand-stimulating measures need to
518	be implemented when the pandemic begins to be brought under control. This
519	means that tourism institutions must start planning measures at the onset of a
520	health crisis."
521	Hotel Chain B operations area manager illustrates the importance of aligning interests
522	with major issuing countries:
523	"We must develop a plan enabling gradual demand reactivation through
524	agreements with issuing countries such as United Kingdom, Germany and France.
525	Once the pandemic is under control, all countries must have the same restrictions
526	at the borders so as not to divert demand to other destinations. The key will be to
527	homogenize health measures among countries with the pandemic under control."
528	Hotel Chain A CEO also discussed the relevance of time and coordination in planning
529	these institutional partnerships to facilitate the arrival of traditional international tourists:
530	"Tourism ministries from different countries should work to coordinate safe
531	tourism corridors. Diligent decisions taken by governments are crucial to avoid
532	any delays, as a one-week delay in decisions on the European corridor can have
533	multiplier proportions in the sector."
534	Consistent with Albert et al. (2004), a Hotel Chain B CEO suggests that cooperation
535	between tourism ministries is needed to achieve a corridor-wide vision. In order to do so,

it is crucial to provide an organizational structure for addressing institutional issues, to develop a branding plan, to manage data for seamless information and to address international visitor needs:

"The hospitality industry do not need destination marketing campaigns promoted by the government in isolation. Spain is a mature destination with sufficiently well-known tourist resources. There is a need of tourist corridors between territories and regions in the form of common rules and health protocols to make travel secure. Governments must design coordinated measures to help protect tourists, while throwing a lifeline to a key industry in countries such as Spain. This corridors should include clear new protocols on flight, accommodation, interaction, meals and visits".

# 4.2. Tour operators relationship management: coordination in the supply area

Many hotel chains depend almost entirely on tour operators for the distribution of their services (Karamustafa, 2000; Bastakis, Buhalis & Butler, 2004). Hotel Chain C CEO illustrates the previous theory regarding the power distribution between hotels and tour operators:

"In holiday and island destinations there is a high dependency on the tour operator. In our case, this is the main source of sales since tourists from the major international issuing markets usually purchase our services through vacation packages. We have no bargaining power over them".

In addition, contracts and agreements are often unilateral, leaving hotel companies exposed if tour operators fail to meet their obligations (Buhalis, 2000; Medina-Muñoz & García-Falcón, 2000). Hotel Chain A financial area manager suggested that in the current demand disruption, each actor tries to protect its own interests, often at the expense of their partners' performance:

"Tour operators have the capacity to unilaterally suspend their guarantee contracts with the hospitality firms. Some of them even demanded the return of customer deposits that had already been processed. For hospitality companies this implies a great business risk and affects the liquidity and therefore the survival of the company in a very dangerous way."

Hotel Chain C operations area manager discussed that this is the most appropriate strategy to follow in the current conditions:

"We are aware that there are tour operators who cannot fulfil their commitments, even if a guarantee contract exists. We have to adapt to this new situation, we will be flexible, helping them to sell as much as possible. Collaboration and understanding is the key."

Hotel Chain B CEO suggest the need to evolve towards a direct sales model to maintain competitiveness in unfavorable contexts in order to increasing their power in the tourism distribution channel and collaborating with tour operators in a more equitable way (Karamustafa, 2000).

"The high dependence of the sector on tour operators seriously endangers our survival. Through direct sales we would gain more control over the end customer, and make relations with tour operators fairer. We cannot forget that to carry out this strategy, it will be necessary to assign technological and human resources".

# 4.3. Competitors relationship management: coordination in the demand and regulation areas

The observation of the Hotel Chain C human resources area manager is in line with research by von Friedrichs Grängsjö & Gummesson (2006), who argue that feeling that many of the problems faced are common to all of them inspires cooperation:

"Although the government is responsible for activating the demand, companies must be able to attract these tourists. In the context of an economic disruption with limited and uncertain demand, collaboration with other hotels to promote the attractiveness and health security of a destination is even more important."

In the same vein, although hotels work together to market the destination, they must balance cooperation and competition, as well as collective and individual action. Thus, the need for a code of conduct to achieve this balance arises (von Friedrichs Grängsjö & Gummesson, 2006). This idea is illustrated by the following quote of a Hotel Chain A CEO:

"Historically, competing hotels could run the risk of entering a price war in case of liquidity needs. Even more solvent companies (operating hotels on their own property) can afford to lower rates to drive competitors out of the market. A price

war will delay the recovery of the sector by at least two or three years. Therefore, companies should be aware of their cost structure, not sell below the cost of production and focus on service differentiation."

In order to achieve differentiation at the sector level, the Hotel Chain B operations area manager suggested collaborating by focusing on safety and quality as main sources of reputation, efficiency and profitability (Tapper & Font, 2004; Benavides and Ortega, 2014).

"Collaboration at sector level to create health standards and/or Covid-free certifications would be a very useful way not to lose competitiveness. The individual development of these standards is very demanding in terms of resources. Cooperating and sharing resources is a more efficient way. In addition, this common effort will allow for greater visibility to project a positive and homogeneous image of the sector."

Finally, Hotel Chain A CEO illustrates the difficulties to achieve favorable conditions despite de importance of the industry:

"Through the employers' associations or lobbies —Alianza para la Excelencia Turística (Exceltur), Confederación Española de Hoteles y Alojamientos Turísticos (CEHAT) and Confederación Española de Organizaciones Empresariales (CEOE)—, attempts have been made to negotiate with the government special regulations for the industry. However, this sector is highly fragmented —in Spain only 20% of hotels belong to a brand or a chain with more than 1000 rooms—.This situation greatly weakens the sector, especially in horizontal decision-making."

#### 5. Discussion and Conclusions

#### **5.1. Theoretical contributions**

Operational risks can cause demand fluctuations or even interruptions on the TSC causing safety issues or inconvenient to tourists making them dissatisfied (Fung & Fung, 2014; Kinra et al., 2019). However, compared to an operational risk, the rapid spatial spread of the COVID-19 outbreak, together with the unpredictable scaling and ripple effect, has resulted in one of the greatest economic disruptions in recent decades. Thus, as a first contribution, we can conclude that the low-frequency and the high-impact nature of the

628 COVID-19 outbreak makes it a disruption risk for the TSC (Kinra et al., 2019; Araz et

629 al., 2020; Ivanov, 2020).

The main goal of this article is to understand the role of relationship management between hotel chains and their key TSC agents in order to overcome economic disruptions caused by epidemic outbreaks such as COVID-19. Managing the TSC implies efficiently developing all chain operations in order to meet the needs of tourists and to fulfill the business objectives of the different TSC members: mainly cost reduction and operational efficiency (Zhang et al., 2009). Tourism supply chains (TSC) are particularly vulnerable to the risks of economic disruptions caused by pandemics and other disasters. In these situations, the results of the study reveal that the business objectives of hotel chains should be particularly focused on obtaining —or not losing— liquidity, preserving labor relationships, reactivating international arrivals, attracting customers, reducing dependence on tour operators and achieving fair relations and greater control over the end customer and, finally, ensuring a favorable regulatory framework for the industry.

In order to achieve these goals, effective inter-organizational relationship management in the TSC is a key aspect in mitigating the economic effects and for the recovery of the industry. This implies coordination between the activities of the agents, as well as consideration of the impact of their actions on other members. Effective upstream and downstream relationship management within the supply chain is a key issue in achieving and maintaining competitiveness for the entire supply chain and its individual agents (Chen, Federgruen, & Zheng, 2001; Tapper & Font, 2004; Christopher, 2011). Zhang et al., 2009).

While TSCs usually involve a wide range of participants in both the private and public sectors, another contribution of the study is the identification of the crucial two-party relationships to be managed by hospitality firms in order to obtain both individual and collective results in contexts of economic disruptions—governments, tour operators, and competitors—. A second contribution is the exploration of key areas for coordination with these actors—finance, labor, demand, supply and regulation—.

#### 5.2. Practical contributions

In a context of economic disruption, governments are major players in the development of the hospitality industry due to their intervention in political and economic issues. They key areas in the relationships are, on the one hand finance and taxation, as well as labor—

- aimed at providing liquidity—, and on the other hand, demand-stimulating issues —
- aimed at reactivating international arrivals— (see Table 2.).
- 662 Economic disruptions and the uncertainty of the first post-pandemic periods causes a
- reductions in revenue and liquidity problems for the hospitality industry. These firms
- 664 have to deal with great part of costs —rent, taxes, maintenance of the facilities,
- employees, and losses related to the hotel opening with less occupation etc.—. Thus,
- 666 liquidity is essential to avoid bankruptcies and to recover the economy. Providing
- liquidity effectively and efficiently requires coordination with governments in areas such
- as finance, taxes and labor. However, according to the results of the study, in the current
- situation of economic disruption, relations between governments and hotel chains seem
- to take arm's length form.
- On the financial side, governments should play a counter-cyclical role in helping
- businesses to mitigate the impact of economic disruptions (Mertens et al., 2020). This
- 673 involves providing public funds on preferential terms, particularly to companies with low
- financial solvency that may have difficulties in obtaining a loan from a commercial bank.
- To this end, the loan guarantee scheme to support firms affected by epidemic crisis should
- be sufficient and should cover up to 100% of new loans and renewal operations. Thus,
- 677 coordination must involve the harmonization of the interests and objectives of the
- 678 government and the commercial banks for the measures to be effective. These entities
- 679 must completely and realistically transfer the benefits of the public guarantee to the
- 680 companies, over and above their private interests.
- On the other hand, the results reveal the need of fiscal arrangements between the
- 682 hospitality industry and the government in order to achieve liquidity and overcome
- disruption risks caused by pandemics. Coordination and information sharing about
- previous years of prosperity, should lead to agreements on the most appropriate fiscal
- measures —mostly based on tax deferral—, for example, those related to the corporate
- tax rate, property tax and VAT on hotel stays.
- With respect to labor, by negotiating temporary layoffs, governments provide companies
- 688 with payroll flexibility, helping to preserve the liquidity (Kopczuk, 2020; Lord & Saad,
- 689 2020). In addition, this measure helps to preserve the employment relationship (López-
- 690 Ahumada, 2020). This is particularly relevant in labor-intensive industries such as
- 691 hospitality, where human resources are a crucial asset as well as a major cost.

In situations of economic disruption, negotiation and coordination are crucial to implement measures more efficiently. Moving from a relationship of arm's length to a relationship of coordination will mean greater consideration of the characteristics, needs and real impact of the hospitality industry by governments. Thus, coordination would imply information sharing and flexibility to address labor issues in a comprehensive and long-term manner through its alignment with the recovery of international demand. Another efficient measure resulting from coordination among both agents would providing liquidity to companies that keep their employees on the payroll by training them to meet the challenges of the post-pandemic environment.

Once tourism activity is reactivated during or after a pandemic period, the results of the study reveal that the recovery of hotel chains will depend on coordination agreements with the government to stimulate demand. While demand management includes forecasting, marketing and sales planning (Zhang et al., 2009), interviews indicate that arrangements must be made in the area of marketing, more specifically in the development of government-supported tourism (Tosun, 2002; Kim, Lee & Mjelde, 2018).

While many countries are moving to promote domestic travel (OECD, 2020), Spanish coordination measures should focus on international demand. The main reason is that the Spanish hotel industry is sized for international arrivals. In addition to the traditional unilateral actions of governments, it should be useful to cooperate with the main issuing countries to stimulate tourist flows after a crisis —United Kingdom, France and Germany—. A possible avenue is through safe tourism corridors in the form of common standards and health protocols to make travel safe and ensure the survival of the industry. Another insight is the importance of time and coordination in the planning of these institutional partnerships to avoid delays that can have multiplier proportions in the sector.

Operating with tour operators is the most cost-effective way for the hospitality industry to distribute accommodation services. According to key research, the study results confirm that for this reason many hotel chains depend almost entirely on these agents to extend its sales and marketing efforts (Medina-Muñoz & García-Falcón, 2000; Calveras & Orfila-Sintes, 2019). Having good relationships based on trust, commitment and coordination with the tour operator is crucial to success.

- 723 It is also confirmed that changes in the market can lead to the failure of supply chain
- partnerships (Forrest & Martin, 1990). In times of economic disruption, financial security
- stands out as a major source of conflict between tourism distribution partners. In addition,
- results show that the heavy dependence on these players and the unilateral nature of the
- agreements leave hotel chains exposed if tour operators do not meet their obligations
- 728 (Buhalis, 2000; Medina-Muñoz & García-Falcón, 2000).
- According to the results, a potential way to evolve to a coordination relationships can be
- 730 moving towards a direct sales model —combined with the tour operator— would be
- useful to increase the negotiating power of hotel chains in the tourism distribution
- channel, to obtain greater control over the end customer and to make relations with tour
- 733 operators fairer.
- Finally, in order to overcome the effects of economic disruption caused by epidemic
- outbreaks, competitors should collaborate in those areas where there is no rivalry —
- destination promotion—, or to influence an industry- favorable regulatory framework
- 737 from a sector level.
- Once the demand is reactivated, companies must be able to attract these tourists by
- 739 cooperating with other hotels through marketing activities such as destination promotion.
- In order to do so, trust between agents is needed. According to Liedtka (1996), trust is
- often generated over time as a result of a history of successful performance among agents.
- However, this study reveals that in case of liquidity needs, firms usually compete in terms
- of price instead of cooperate.
- 744 Thus, coordination between hotels should imply following certain code of conduct to
- achieve balance between cooperation and competition and early sector recovery, avoiding
- 746 war prices by focusing on sectoral differentiation based on safety and quality.
- 747 Consequently, in order to achieve sectoral differentiation to attract demand cooperation
- should focus on creating health standards or Covid-free certifications. This type of
- 749 initivatives allow companies to create more value than if they achieve in an individual
- 750 way (Pomponi et al., 2015; Ann Peng, Yen & Bourne, 2018).
- 751 From a sectoral perspective, for highly fragmented sectors such hospitality, it is difficult
- to achieve favorable conditions despite the industry's contribution to the country's wealth.
- 753 Therefore, concentration on lobbying would be particularly useful to increase the

/54	bargaining	power	to 1	influence	regulatory	Irameworks	ın	tne	context	ΟI	an	economic
755	disruption.											
756												
757												
758												
759												
760												
761												
762												
763												

Table 2. Model of two- party relationship and coordination management aspects between hotel chains and their key TSC agents

Type of	Key	Coordination areas									
relationship	agents	Finance	Labor	Demand	Supply	Regulation					
Vertical	Governments	Public funds on real preferential terms  Aligned objectives between government and commercial banks (intermediaries)  Tax deferral: corporate tax rate, property tax and VAT on hotel stays	Negotiation of temporary layoffs  Alignment with recovery of international demand  Keeping employees on the payroll by training	Marketing activities: government-supported tourism  Safe tourism corridors: time and coordination	-	-					
	Tour operators	-	-	-	Trust, commitment and coordination  Evolution towards a direct sales model	-					
Horizontal	Com- petitors	-	-	Marketing activities: destination promotion	-	Concentration on lobbying					
Objectives		Liquidity	Liquidity Employment relationship preservation	International arrivals reactivation  Attraction of customers	Reducing dependency Fair relations Greater control end customer	Industry- favorable regulatory framework					

# 5.3. Limitations and future research agenda

The results obtained in this research must be interpreted with caution due to the limitations inherent to its methodological design. The qualitative methodology does not allow us to understand the phenomenon studied in other contexts or to draw conclusions that can be extrapolated to other sectors. In addition, another limitation stems from only interviewing three Spanish hotel chains. Moreover, like any other research work, it raises new questions allowing us to further deepen the study of study of interorganizational relations in similar crisis contexts.

Studies analyzing the financial or performance effects of the COVID-19, both in the hospitality sector and others, will help governments and managers to reduce the negative effects that may arise in future crises, by identifying the measures that have proven to be most appropriate. Surveys and the use of statistical techniques for analysis can improve the understanding of this phenomenon and make recommendations to the industry. It would also be interesting to distinguish between how large international hotel chains and independent hotels have responded to the crisis.

In line with the decision-making process, the creation of relationships between different agents —government, tour operators or competitors— are key to overcoming crises in the hospitality industry. Therefore, another line of concern is the analysis of these network of relationships in terms of number, objectives, whether they have been occasional or long-lasting relationships or the results achieved. In this regard, the study of the cultural integration and the diversity management in the Managing relationships with key agents in the Tourism Supply Chain and their role in the process' success can help in new crisis.

Human resources are the main resource in the hotel industry so the way hotels have managed the crisis can be a motivating element for staff or, on the other hand, it can encourage the loss of workers and talent. Therefore, the analysis of the effect of the measures implemented by the government, with the temporary suspension of employment, and the measures adopted by companies in aspects of health and safety, salaries, adaptation of jobs, etc. are an interesting line of study.

#### 797 References

- Ahmad, R., Ali, N. A. (2003). The use of cognitive mapping technique in management research: theory and practice. Management Research News 26(7), 1-16.
- Albert, S., Wright, P.M., Taylor, J.E., Shi, X., Lee, S. 2004. Final report CANAMEX smart tourist corridor. CANAMEX Corridor, Montana.
- Ann Peng, T.J., Yen, M-H, Bourne, M. 2018. How rival partners compete based on cooperation?, Long Range Planning 51, 351-383.
- Araz, O.M., Choi, T.M., Olson, D., Salman, F.S. 2020. Data analytics for operational risk management. Decision Sciences, https://doi.org/10.1111/deci.12443
- Ataguba, J.E. 2020. COVID-19 Pandemic, a War to be Won: Understanding its Economic Implications for Africa. Applied Health Economics and Health Policy, 18, 325-328.
- Bastakis, C., Buhalis, D., Butler, R. 2004. The perception of small and medium sized tourism accommodation providers on the impacts of the tour operators' power in Eastern Mediterranean. Tourism management 25(2), 151-170.
- Benavides-Chicón, C.G., Ortega, B. 2014. The impact of quality management on productivity in the hospitality sector. International Journal of Hospitality Management 42, 165–173
- Breitmayer, B. J., Ayres, L., Knafl, K. A. 1993. Triangulation in qualitative research: Evaluation of completeness and confirmation purposes. Image: The Journal of Nursing Scholarship, 25(3), 237-243.
- Brunner, H.P. 2013. What Is Economic Corridor Development and What Can It Achieve in Asia's Subregions?. Asian Development Bank Economics Working Paper Series 117, 1-38.
- Buhalis, D. 2000. Relationships in the distribution channel of tourism: Conflicts between hoteliers and tour operators in the Mediterranean region. International Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Administration 1(1), 113-139.
- Buhalis, D., Laws, E. 2001. Tourism distribution channels: Practices, issues and transformations. Cengage Learning EMEA, Hampshire.
- Calveras, A., Orfila-Sintes, F. 2019. Intermediation in hospitality and transaction cost theory: Evidence from the Balearic Islands, 2001–2010. Journal of destination marketing & management 11, 281-291.
- Chathoth, P.K., Olsen, M.D. 2003. Strategic alliances: a hospitality industry perspective.
  International Journal of Hospitality Management 22(4), 419-434.
- Chen, F., Federgruen, A., Zheng, Y.S. 2001. Coordination mechanisms for a distribution system with one supplier and multiple retailers. Management science 47(5), 693-708.
- Chen, M.H., Jang, S.S., Kim, W.G. 2007. The impact of the SARS outbreak on Taiwanese hotel stock performance: an event-study approach. International Journal of Hospitality Management 26(1), 200-212.
- Chiles, T. H., & McMackin, J. F. 1996. Integrating variable risk preferences, trust, and transaction cost economics. Academy of management review, 21(1), 73-99.

Christopher, M. 2011. Logistics & supply chain management. Pearson education limited, 837 United Kingdom. 838

839

- Corbin, J., Strauss, A. 2014. Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures 840 for developing grounded theory. Sage publications, New York. 841
- De Rosa, M., Lanzilotta, B., Perazzo, I., Vigorito, A. 2020. Las políticas económicas y 842 sociales frente a la expansión de la pandemia de COVID-19: aportes para el 843 debate. Aportes y análisis en tiempos de coronavirus. Instituto de Economía, 844

845 Uruguay.

- 846 Del Campo, M., Ferreiro, F. (2012). El ICO. Una alternativa preferente a la financiación 847 productiva privada. Escuela de Fianazas, A Coruña.
- ECDC 2020. https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/cases-2019-ncov-eueea. Accessed: 25 May 848 849 2020.
- European Parliament 2020. Covid-19: EU support for the tourism industry. Retrieved 850 from:https://www.europarl.europa.eu/news/en/headlines/society/20200429STO781 851 75/covid-19-eu-support-for-the-tourism-industry. Accessed: August, 2020.Forrest, 852 J.E., Martin, M.J. 1990. Strategic alliances: lessons from the new biotechnology 853

industry. Engineering Management Journal 2(1), 13-22. 854

- 855 Fortune, 2020. https://fortune.com/2020/02/21/fortune-1000-coronavirus-china-supplychain-impact/, accessed on March 10, 2020. 856
- Friese. S. (2018).available 857 ATLAS. mac user manual, at: 858 http://downloads.atlasti.com/docs/ manual/manual a8 mac en.pdf (accessed 15 May 2020). 859
- Gnyawali, D.R., Madhavan, R. 2001. Cooperative networks and competitive dynamics: 860 a structural embeddedness perspective. Academy of Management Review 26, 431-861 445. 862
- Gnyawali, D.R., Park, B.J.R., 2009. Co-opetition and technological innovation in small 863 and medium-sized enterprises: a multilevel conceptual model. Journal of Small 864 Business Management 47(3), 308-330. 865
- Goldhar, J.D., Lei, D. 1991. The shape of twenty-first century global manufacturing. The 866 Journal of Business Strategy 12(2), 37-41. 867
- Gomez, V.B., Sinclair, M.T. 1991. Integration in the tourism industry: A case study 868 approach. In M. T. Sinclair, & M. J. Stabler (Eds.), The tourism industry: An 869 international analysis (pp. 67-90). Wallingford, UK: CAB International.Guo, X., He, 870 L. 2012. Tourism supply-chain coordination: The cooperation between tourism hotel 871 and tour operator. Tourism Economics 18(6), 1361-1376. 872
- 873 Hall, C. M. 1994. Tourism and politics: policy, power and place. John Wiley & Sons, New Jersey. 874
- Handfield, R.B., Nichols, E.L. 1999, Introduction to Supply Chain Management, 875 Prentice-Hall, New Jersey. 876

- Hoyt, J., Huq, F. 2000. From arms-length to collaborative relationships in the supply
- chain. International Journal of Physical Distribution & Logistics Management. 30(9),
- 879 750-764
- 880 ICAO 2020. Effects of Novel Coronavirus (COVID-19) on Civil Aviation: Economic
- Impact Analysis. Retrieved from: https://www.icao.int/sustainability/Documents/
- 882 COVID-
- 9/ICAO%20Coronavirus%202020%2004%2008%20Econ%20Impact.pdf.INE
- 884 (2019). https://www.ine.es/en/daco/daco42/frontur/frontur1218\_en.pdf Consulted
- 885 20 May 2020
- INE 2020. Hotel Tourism Short-Term Trends (HOS/HPI/IPHS) June 2020. Provisional data. Retrieved from: https://www.ine.es/en/daco/daco42/prechote/cth0620 en.pdf
- 888 Ivanov, D. 2020. Predicting the impacts of epidemic outbreaks on global supply chains:
- A simulation-based analysis on the coronavirus outbreak (COVID-19/SARS-CoV-
- 2) case. Transportation Research Part E: Logistics and Transportation Review, 136,
- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tre.2020.101922.
- Jiang, Y., Ritchie, B.W. 2017. Disaster collaboration in tourism: Motives, impediments and success factors. Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management 31, 70-82.
- 894 Jiang, Y.; Ritchie, B.W.; Benckendorff, P. 2019. Bibliometric visualisation: an
- application in tourism crisis and disaster management research, Current Issues in
- 896 Tourism, 22 (16), 1925-1957. Karamustafa, K. 2000. Marketing-channel
- Relationships: Turkeys Resort Purveyors' Interactions with International Tour
- Operators. Cornell hotel and restaurant administration quarterly 41(4), 21-31.
- Karnon, J. 2020. A Simple Decision Analysis of a Mandatory Lockdown Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic. Applied Health Economics and Health Policy 18(3), 329-331.
- 801 Kaukal, M., Werthner, H., Hoepken, W. 2000. An approach to enable interoperability in
- 902 electronic tourism markets. ECIS 2000 Proceedings 121.
- 903 https://aisel.aisnet.org/ecis2000/121
- 904 Kim, J., Lee, C.K. 2017. Role of tourism price in attracting international tourists: The
- ocase of Japanese inbound tourism from South Korea. Journal of Destination
- 906 Marketing & Management 6(1), 76-83.
- 907 Kim, J., Lee, C.K., Mjelde, J.W. 2018. Impact of economic policy on international
- tourism demand: the case of Abenomics. Current Issues in Tourism 21(16), 1912-
- 909 1929.
- Kinra, A., Ivanov, D., Das, A., Dolgui, A. 2019. Ripple effect quantification by supplier
- 911 risk exposure assessment. International Journal of Production Research, 1-20.
- Some thoughts on economics and policy at the time of the pandemics.
- Department of Economics and SIPA, Columbia University, New York.
- 814 Kruesi, M., Kim, P. B., Hemmington, N. 2017. Evaluating foreign market entry mode
- 915 theories from a hotel industry perspective. International Journal of Hospitality
- 916 Management, 62, 88-100.
- 917 Kuo, H.I., Chen, C.C., Tseng, W.C., Ju, L.F., Huang, B.W. 2008. Assessing impacts of
- 918 SARS and Avian Flu on international tourism demand to Asia. Tourism Management
- 919 29(5), 917-928.Larrinaga, O.V., Rodríguez, J.L. 2010. El estudio de casos como

- 920 metodología de investigación científica en dirección y economía de la empresa. Una
- 921 aplicación a la internacionalización. Investigaciones Europeas de Dirección y
- 922 Economía de la Empresa, 16, 31–52.
- Law, R., Goh, C., Pine, R. 2004. Modeling tourism demand: A decision rules based approach. Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing 16(2-3), 61-69.
- Lebel, L., Lebel, B. 2019. Road to shared prosperity: The elaboration and influence of a
- 926 transboundary policy narrative for regional economic integration. Asia Pacific
- 927 Viewpoint 60(3), 339-354.
- 928 Lee, C.K., Song, H.J., Bendle, L.J., Kim, M.J., Han, H. 2012. The impact of non-
- pharmaceutical interventions for 2009 H1N1 influenza on travel intentions: A model
- of goal-directed behavior. Tourism Management 33(1), 89-99.
- Leenders, M.R., Fearson, H.E., Flynn, A.E., Johnson, P.F. 2002. Purchasing and supply
- management. McGraw-Hill/Irwin, New York.
- 933 López Ahumada, J.E. (2020). Flexibilidad, protección del empleo y seguridad social
- durante la pandemia global del Covid-19. Instituto Universitario de Investigación de
- 935 Estudios Latinoamericanos 134, 1-74.
- 936 Lord, P. 2020. Incentivising Employment during the COVID-19
- 937 Pandemic. http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3573176
- 938 Lord, P., Saad, L. 2020. Tackling the COVID-19 Pandemic.
- 939 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.arcmed.2020.04.012
- 940 Mandal, S., Saravanan, D. 2019. Exploring the influence of strategic orientations on
- tourism supply chain agility and resilience: An empirical investigation. Tourism
- Planning & Development 16(6), 612-636.Manuj, I., Mentzer, J.T. 2008. Global
- 943 supply chain risk management strategies. International Journal of Physical
- Distribution & Logistics Management 38(3), 192-223.
- 945 Martínez-Pérez, Á., García-Villaverde, P.M., Elche, D. 2016. The mediating effect of
- ambidextrous knowledge strategy between social capital and innovation of cultural
- 947 tourism clusters firms. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality
- 948 Management 28(7), 1484-1507.
- Mayer, J.D. 2000. Geography, ecology and emerging infectious diseases. Social science
- 950 & medicine 50(7-8), 937-952.
- 951 Medina-Muñoz, D., García-Falcón, J.M. 2000. Successful relationships between hotels
- and agencies. Annals of Tourism Research 27(3), 737-762.
- 953 Medina-Muñoz, R.D., Medina-Muñoz, D.R., García-Falcón, J.M. 2003. Understanding
- European tour operators' control on accommodation companies: an empirical
- evidence. Tourism Management 24(2), 135-147.
- 956 Merriam, S.B. 1998. Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education.
- Revised and Expanded from" Case Study Research in Education"; Jossey-Bass
- 958 Publishers: San Francisco.
- 959 Mertens, D., Rubio, E., Thiemann, M. 2020. COVID-19 and the Mobilisation of Public
- Development Banks in the EU. Policy Paper 252, 1-9.

- 961 Mohr, J., Spekman, R. 1994. Characteristics of partnership success: partnership attributes,
- ommunication behavior, and conflict resolution techniques. Strategic management
- 963 journal 15(2), 135-152.
- 964 Monczka, R.M., Petersen, K.J., Handfield, R.B., Ragatz, G.L. 1998. Success factors in
- strategic supplier alliances: the buying company perspective. Decision
- 966 sciences 29(3), 553-577.
- Morrison, M. A., Haley, E., Sheehan, K. B., Taylor, R. E. 2002. Listening to consumers:
- the qualitative interview. Using Qualitative Research in Advertising, Sage, Thousand
- 969 Oaks, CA, 45-61.
- 970 Novelli, M., Burgess, LG., Jones, A., Ritchie, B.W. 2018. 'No Ebola...still doomed' -
- The Ebola-induced tourism crisis. Annals of Tourism Research 70, 76-87.
- 972 Nunkoo, R., Ramkissoon, H. 2011. Developing a community support model for
- tourism. Annals of Tourism Research 38(3), 964-988.
- 974 Nunkoo, R., Ramkissoon, H., Gursoy, D. 2012. Public trust in tourism
- 975 institutions. Annals of Tourism Research 39(3), 1538-1564.
- 976 Nyaupane, G.P., Timothy, D.J. 2010. Power, regionalism and tourism policy in
- 977 Bhutan. Annals of Tourism Research 37(4), 969-988.
- 978 OECD 2020. Tourism Policy Responses to the coronavirus (COVID-19). Retrieved from:
- 979 https://www.oecd.org/coronavirus/policy-responses/tourism-policy-responses-to-
- 980 the-coronavirus-covid-19-6466aa20/#endnotea0z14. Accessed: August,
- 981 2020. Onrubia Fernández, J. 2020. Crisis económica en tiempos del COVID-19: La
- hora de la política fiscal... y de la gestión pública. Instituto Complutense de Estudios
- 983 Internacionales 6, 1-10.
- Orchiston, C., Higham, J.E.S. 2016. Knowledge management and tourism recovery (de)
- 985 marketing: the Christchurch earthquakes 2010–2011. Current Issues in Tourism
- 986 19(1), 64-84.
- 987 Ortega-Pestana, J.L., 2019. Ranking Hosteltur de grandes cadenas hoteleras. Revista
- 988 Hosteltur. Septiembre 2019, 21-25.
- Pechlaner, H., Volgger, M. 2012. How to promote cooperation in the hospitality industry:
- 990 Generating practitioner-relevant knowledge using the GABEK qualitative research
- strategy. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management 24(6), 925-
- 992 945.
- 993 Pieterse, H.J. 2020. The Grounded Theory methodology to conduct content analysis of
- sermons and interviews: Critique and response. HTS Theological Studies 76(1), 1-5.
- 995 Pizam, A., Fleischer, A. 2002. Severity versus frequency of acts of terrorism: Which has
- a larger impact on tourism demand?. Journal of Travel research 40(3), 337-339.
- 997 Pomponi, P., Fratocchi, L., Tafuri, S.R. 2015. Trust development and horizontal
- 998 collaboration in logistics: a theory based evolutionary framework. Supply Chain
- 999 Management: An International Journal 20 (1), 83 97
- 1000 Ranera, I. 2020. COVID-19 Medidas de Apoyo a la industria hotelera una comparativa
- europea abril 2020. Cristie & Co, Barcelona.

- Racherla, P., Hu, C. 2009. A framework for knowledge-based crisis management in the 1002 hospitality and tourism industry. Cornell Hospitality Quarterly 50(4), 561-577. 1003
- 1004 Real Decreto-ley 8/2020, de 17 de marzo, de medidas urgentes extraordinarias para hacer frente al impacto económico y social del COVID-19. 1005
- 1006 Richards, P., Font, X. 2019. Sustainability in the tour operator-ground agent supply chain. Journal of Sustainable Tourism 27(3), 277-291. Ring, P.S., Van de Ven, A.H. 1007 1992. Structuring cooperative relationships between organizations. Strategic 1008 Management Journal 13(7), 483-498. 1009
- 1010 Ritchie, B.W., Jiang, Y. 2019. A review of research on tourism risk, crisis and disaster management: Launching the annals of tourism research curated collection on tourism 1011 1012 risk, crisis and disaster management. Annals of Tourism Research 79, 102812.
- Rivera Mateos, M., Félix Mendoza, Á.G. 2019. Planificación estratégica y gobernanza en 1013 la recuperación de destinos turísticos afectados por desastres socio-naturales. Un 1014 1015 estado de la cuestión. Investigaciones Geográficas 72, 235-254.
- 1016 Rodríguez-Sánchez, J.-L., Ortiz-de-Urbina-Criado, M., Mora-Valentín, E.-M. 2020. Human resource management in merger and acquisition planning. Journal of 1017 Organizational Change Management 33(1), 16-28. 1018
- Rubio-Andrada, L., Alonso-Almeida, M.M., Rodríguez-Antón, J. 2011. Motivations and 1019 impacts in the firm and stakeholders of quality certification: evidence from small-1020 and médium-sized service enterprises. Total Quality Management & Business 1021 Excellence 22, 833-852. 1022
- 1023 Sangpikul, A., Kim, S. 2009). An overview and identification of barriers affecting the meeting and convention industry in Thailand. Journal of Convention & Event 1024 Tourism, 10(3), 185-210). Serrano Antón, F. 2020. Medidas fiscales terapéuticas y 1025 1026 COVID 19. Instituto Complutense de Estudios Internacionales 7, 1-4.
- Shea, C.M., Howell, J.M. 1998. Organizational antecedents to the successful 1027 implementation of total quality management: a social cognitive perspective. Journal 1028 of Quality Management 3(1), 3-24. 1029
- Sifolo, P.P., Molefe, L.P., Henama, U.S., Tauoatsoala, P., Manavhela, P. 2019. 1030 Investigating the supply chain drivers and barriers in the tourism industry in Pretoria. 1031 Journal of Transport and Supply Chain Management, 13, 1-8. 1032
- Sigala, M. 2004. Collaborative supply chain management in the airline sector: the role of 1033 global distribution systems (GDS). Advances in Hospitality and Leisure 1 (1), 103-1034 121. Szpilko, D. 2017. Tourism Supply Chain-overview of selected literature. 1035
- Procedia Engineering, 182, 687-693. 1036
- Tapper, R., Font, X. 2004. Tourism supply chains. Report of a Desk Research Project for 1037 The Travel Foundation, Leeds Metropolitan University, Leeds. 1038
- Tether, B.S. 2002. Who co-operates for innovation, and why: an empirical 1039 analysis. Research policy 31(6), 947-967. 1040
- Tse, A.C.B. 2003. Disintermediation of travel agents in the hotel industry. International 1041 Journal of Hospitality Management 22(4), 453-460. 1042

- Tosun, C. 2002. Host perceptions of impacts: A comparative tourism study. Annals of
- tourism research 29(1), 231-253.
- Varguillas, C. 2006. El uso de atlas. Ti y la creatividad del investigador en el análisis
- cualitativo de contenido UPEL. Laurus 12, 73-87
- 1047 Von Friedrichs Grängsjö, Y., Gummesson, E. 2006. Hotel networks and social capital in
- destination marketing. International Journal of Service Industry Management 17(1),
- 1049 58-75.
- Wang, Y., Krakover, S. 2008. Destination marketing: competition, cooperation or
- 1051 coopetition?. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management 20,
- 1052 126-141.
- 1053 Williams, A.M., Baláž, V. 2015. Tourism risk and uncertainty: Theoretical
- reflections. Journal of Travel Research 54(3), 271-287.
- 1055 Yılmaz, Y., Bititci, U.S. 2006. Performance measurement in tourism: a value chain
- model. International journal of contemporary hospitality management 18(4), 341-
- 1057 349.

- 1058 Yin, R.K. 1998. The abridged version of case study research. In Handbook of Applied
- Social Research Methods; Bickman, L.T., Debra, J.R., Eds.; Sage Publications:
- 1060 Thousand Oaks, 229–259.
- 1061 Yu, P. L. 2019. Interfirm coopetition, trust, and opportunism: a mediated moderation
- model. Review of Managerial Science 13(5), 1069-1092.
- Zhang, X., Song, H., Huang, G. Q. 2009. Tourism supply chain management: A new
- research agenda. Tourism management 30(3), 345-358.